



Rights vs. Welfare

Middle School Food and Agricultural Literacy Curriculum

Precepts

- L. Spiritual Growth
- L2. Respect and be sensitive to others' beliefs

National Standards

- AS.06.01.02.a. Explain the implications of animal welfare and animal rights for animal agriculture.
- NL-ENG.K-12.4 – Communication Skills
- NL-ENG.K-12.12 – Applying Language Skills

Student Learning Objectives

- As a result of this **unit** the students will...
- Discuss animal issues.
- As a result of this **lesson** the student will...
- Compare and contrast Animal welfare versus Animal rights.

Content Outline

Objective 1. Compare and contrast **Animal welfare** vs. **Animal rights**.

- A. Define:
 - 1. **Animal rights**
 - a. **Animal rights** is a philosophical view that animals have rights similar to or the same as humans. True **animal rights** proponents believe that humans do not have the right to use animals at all. **Animal rights** proponents wish to ban all use of animals by humans.
 - 2. **Animal welfare**
 - a. **Animal welfare**, as defined by the American Veterinary Medical Association, is a human responsibility that encompasses all aspects of animal well-being, including proper housing, management, disease prevention and treatment, responsible care, humane handling, and, when necessary, humane euthanasia.

Time

Instruction time for this lesson: 45 minutes.

Resources

Animal Welfare vs. Animal Rights. Retrieved August 20, 2009, from Animal Welfare Council Web site: <http://www.animalwelfarecouncil.com/html/aw/rights.php>

Tools, Equipment, and Supplies

- Writing surface
- Overhead projector/transparencies
- MS.AI.4.1.TM.A – one per teacher
- MS.AI.4.1.TM.B – one per teacher
- MS.AI.4.1.TM.C – one per teacher
- MS.AI.4.1.RUBRIC.A – one per group of four
- MS.AI.4.1.ASSESS.A – one per student

Key Terms

The following terms are presented in this lesson and appear in bold italics:

Animal welfare

Animal rights

- B. Describe beliefs of ***Animal rights***/welfare
 - 1. ***Animal welfare***
 - a. ***Animal welfare*** supporters:
 - i. improve the treatment and well-being of animals.
 - ii. believe that humans can interact with animals if the proper care and management for all animals is involved.
 - iii. use science to determine effective care and safe handling procedures.
 - 2. ***Animal rights***
 - a. support laws and regulations that would prohibit:
 - i. rodeos
 - ii. horse racing
 - iii. circuses
 - iv. hunting
 - v. life-saving medical research using animals
 - vi. raising of livestock for food



Lesson Number: MS.AI.4.1

Middle School Food and Agricultural Literacy Curriculum

Rights vs. Welfare

C. Create skit, present

D. Compare and contrast with Venn Diagram

Interest Approach

Show students two videos showing the opposite sides of animal treatment. The first video is one from PETA, the other is a video of the "Happy Cows Come from California" campaign. Show the first video entitled "Who cares about Mice and Rats?" <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Zjo-Kp5rekQ> follow that up with the "California Cows Singing" <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YzZeZf5suq8>.

Before watching the videos, be sure to set your expectations and remind students that not everyone will share the same feelings and beliefs about each video.

If the video is not available, contact a local animal shelter and obtain a story about an animal that is available for adoption. Share the story with students and encourage them to think about what types of animals they would be willing to adopt. Sure, most people would be willing to adopt a cute and cuddly kitten or puppy, but what about a mouse that had previously been used in lab experiments, or what about a snake that had escaped from its cage and the owner no longer wants it?

Good morning and welcome back to Ag Explorations today. In a few moments, we're going to take a look at two different videos showing the opposite sides of animal production. The first is a video produced by PETA (People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals). Please remember that as we watch these videos, not everyone will share your opinion. Please be cautious of the opinions and beliefs of others. After watching the videos, we will have an opportunity to discuss what we watched.

Show "Who cares about Mice and Rats?" <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Zjo-Kp5rekQ> follow that up with "California Cows Singing" <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YzZeZf5suq8>

Now that we have seen both videos, who will be the first to share what you are thinking? Thank you, who's next? OK, even if you did not completely agree with either video, what can we learn from watching these? Just as these two videos show, there are two main beliefs regarding animal production. Today will be a fun-filled day spent exploring the differences between **Animal welfare** and **Animal rights**.

Summary of Content and Teaching Strategies

Objective 1. Compare and contrast **animal welfare** versus **animal rights**.

In order for us to compare and contrast **animal rights** versus **animal welfare**, let's first take a look at the definitions. Please capture these terms and their definitions in your notes.

Show **MS.AI.4.1.TM.A**.

Use the Me-You-Us e-Moment® to have students share examples of **animal rights** and **animal welfare**.

Keeping the definition in mind, when I say GO, you will have three minutes to come up with at least one example each of **animal rights** and **animal welfare**. Be ready to share. GO

Allow students time to come up with their examples. Provide examples and guidance as needed. Students will then pair and create a list of three of each.

When you hear PAIR you have two more minutes to find a partner and identify at least three examples of **animal welfare** and three examples of **animal rights**. You can include your own examples to create your list of three. Your group should be prepared to share your examples with the rest of the class. PAIR.

As students are brainstorming their examples, listen for great answers and ask that group if they would be willing to share their responses in a few minutes.

Great work, everyone; I definitely heard some amazing discussion going on. What groups are willing to share? These are all great answers. Now let's take a look at the beliefs of **animal welfare** supporters and those that believe in **animal rights**.

Show **MS.AI.4.1.TM.B** and **MS.AI.4.1.TM.C** with the beliefs.

Think back to the two videos we watched at the beginning of class and now bring in what we know about **animal welfare** and **animal rights**. Which of these two do you more closely resemble? Why? Who will share?



Lesson Number: MS.AI.4.1

Middle School Food and Agricultural Literacy Curriculum

Rights vs. Welfare

If you didn't show the videos, refer to the story from your local pet shelter. How would they treat an animal if they were a pet owner? What would their reaction be if their puppy had an accident on their bedroom floor or if their snake escaped?

Give each group a copy of **MS.AI.4.1.RUBRIC.A** as a guide for the next activity.

When I say SKIT, we will have ten minutes to plan a skit that will show the differences between **animal rights** and **animal welfare**. Be creative and make sure each person in the group plays an active part in planning and presenting your skit. Be sure that you show the difference between **animal rights** and **welfare**, that all members of your group are actively involved, and that you're creative and use your time wisely. Use the rubric you are now receiving to ensure your group earns as many points as possible. Form groups of four. What questions are there? How long do you have? SKIT!

Monitor student progress for the next ten minutes to ensure that all students are actively participating and staying on task. Also be sure to provide regular time updates. At the end of ten minutes, ask groups to begin to present their skits. Use the provided rubric to evaluate each presentation.

Review/Summary

Wow, we witnessed some amazing skits showing the differences between **animal welfare** and **animal rights**. Think about your stance on **animal rights** and **animal welfare**. What do you think we should be able to use animals for? Is it okay for you to own a pet? What about using animals in laboratories? Everyone will have a different stance, but it is up to you to be aware of the information in order to develop your stance on the issue.

Application

Extended classroom activity:

Students can list ways they care for the welfare of their pets or livestock.

FFA activity:

FFA members can develop a presentation illustrating why **animal welfare** is important to local animal producers. Present the creation at a school board meeting or local civic organization.

SAE activity:

Students can volunteer at a local pet adoption location to understand the importance of **animal welfare**.

Evaluation

MS.AI.4.1.ASSESS.A

Answers to Evaluation

Answers will vary. Rubric provided for group presentations.



ANIMAL WELFARE

Animal welfare, as defined by the American Veterinary Medical Association, is a human responsibility that encompasses all aspects of animal well-being, including proper housing, management, disease prevention and treatment, responsible care, humane handling, and, when necessary, humane euthanasia.

ANIMAL RIGHTS

Animal rights is a philosophical view that animals have rights similar to or the same as humans. Animal rights proponents believe that humans do not have the right to use animals at all. Animal rights proponents wish to ban all use of animals by humans.



Animal welfare Supporters:

- **improve the treatment and well-being of animals.**
- **believe that humans can interact with animals if the proper care and management for all animals is involved.**
- **use science to determine effective care and safe handling procedures.**



Animal rights Supporters: support laws and regulations that would prohibit:

- rodeos
- horse racing
- circuses
- hunting
- life-saving medical research using animals
- raising of livestock for food
- petting zoos



Category	Excellent (5 pts)	Average (3 pts)	Poor (1 pt)
Effectively shows the differences between animal rights and animal welfare			
Team members were equally involved in creating the skit and presenting the skit.			
Overall effectiveness: creativity, time management, presentation (not reading from notes), etc.			